

F Ø[Yb. '% ! Å\ f][Yf`bUWk `7UVf]c!l bZU`
gWk Yf`j Yf`Yhnh` `Dc`]nY]`gi Wk h`NYi [Yb

9]b '% ! Å\ f][Yf`GWk ØYf`k i fXY`Ui ZF Ø[Yb`j cb`Y]bYa `6A K !
7UVf]c`Ub[YZU\ fYb`"8]Y`Dc`]nY]`gi Wk h`bUWk `XYa `ZØWk h][Yb
: U\ fYf"

⇒ Y]bYf`gWk cW_]YfYbXYb`K YbXi b[`k Å\ fYbX`Y]bYf`?`UggYbZU\ fh
k i fXY`Y]b` '% ! Å\ f][Yf`GWk ØYf`Ui g`6fYa Yb`Ui ZF Ø[Yb`j cb`Y]bYa
7UVf]c`Ub[YZU\ fYb`"8Yf`J cfZU`YfY][bYhY`g]Wk `Ua `A]hk cWk UVYbX
]a `C fhghY]`DfcfUž`U`g`X]Y`GWk ØYf[fi ddY`Ui ZXYa `K Y[`k Ufž`U`g
XYf: U\ fYf`XYg: U\ fnYi [gž`a i ha U» `]Wk `Y]b`g]`VYfbYg`6A K !
7UVf]cž`bUWk `Y]bYf`Dfcj c`_Uh]cb`VYk i ggh`Ui ZXYb`ž b[Yb`ni Ž \ f"

B UWk `6Yf]Wk hYb`XYf`Dc`]nY]`GhfU`gi bXžj Yfk]W`Y`hY`g]Wk `XYf
GWk ØYf`a]h`XYa `: U\ fnYi [ZU\ fYf`i bX`a UWk hY`Y]bY: YghYž`X]Y`XYb
5i hcZU\ fYf`XUni `j YfUb`UgghYž`ni `k YbXYb`i bX`a]h`c\ Yf
: YgWk]bX][_Y]h`Ui Z]\b`ni ni ZU\ fYb`"NYi [Yb`VYf]Wk hYbž`XUgg`XYf
: U\ fYf`XYf`l bZU`i fgUWk Y`X]fY`h`Ybh[Y[YbghYi YfhY`i bX`XYb
ž b[Yb`a Y\ fYfY`A YhYf`Xi fWk `X]Y`@ Zh`gWk `Yi XYfhYž`VYj cf`X]YgYf
gWk Yf`j Yf`Yhnh`Ui ZY]bYf`K]YgY`ni ``]Y[Yb`_Ua `"NYi [Yb
VYgWk fY]VYb`X]Y`9g`U`Uh]cb`U`g`UVfi dh`i bX`VYi bfi \][YbX"

8 YhU]`g`ni a `J cfZU``i bX`ni f`a YX]n]b]gWk Yb
J Yfgcf[i b[

⇒ XYf`NY]hj ca `l bZU``V]g`ni a `9]bhfYZZYb`XYf`FYhhi b[g_fÅZhY`k Uf
Yg`Ui Z[fi bX`XYf`ZY\`YbXYb`< UbXmg`gWk]Yf][ž<]ZY`ni `c`Yb`"8]Y
GWk ØYfž`Ui g[YfØghYh`bi f`a]h`XYa `K]`Ybž`\ fYa `j Yf`YhnhYb
?`UggYb`_Ua YfUXYb`VY]ni ghY\Ybž`hfi [Yb`]\b`ni f`ž [YbX\YfVYf[Y"
8cfh`_cbbhYb`g]Y`gWk `]Y» `]Wk `X]Y`FYhhi b[g_fÅZhY`]bZcfa]YfYbž`k Ug
a Ò[`]Wk Yfk Y]gY`YVYbgfYhYbX`k Uf"

8 Yf'gWk Yf'j Yf'YhnhY'đ b[Y'k i fXY'ni bÅW ghj cf' C fhj cb'Y]bYa
BchUfnhij Yfgcf[hi bX'UbgW`Y» YbX'a]h'Y]bYa ' < i VgW fUi VYf']bg
?']b]_i a ' bUW` ; fY]Zgk U`X' [YZc [Yb'"@Ui h'6Yf]W hYb'Yf']hhYb`X]Y
YfnhY`Y]b`GW ÅXY'! <]fbhfUi a U'gck]Y'a Y\ fYfY
GW b]hhj Yf'Yhni b[Ybž`YXcW` [`ØW`]W Yfk Y]gY`_Y]bY`]bbYfYb
J Yf'Yhni b[Yb'cXYf' ? bcW YbVfØW Y'"8 Yf'GW Ø'Yf' _cbbhY
gW`]Y» `]W` X Ug' ? fUb`_Yb` \Ui g'j Yf'UggYb`i bX`]gh'a]hhYfk Y`Y
k]YXYf']b`6fYa Yb"

8]Y'gW i `]gW Yb`5_hj]hÅhYb`g]bX`]b`XYf`Nk]gW YbnY]h`bUhØf`]W
VYhfcZYb'"8]Y` ?`UggYbZU` fh'k]fX`Ua` : fY]hU[`VYYbXYhž'i bX`X]Y
GW Ø'Yf' _Y\ fYb`a]h[Ya]gW hYb` ; YZØ`Yb`bUW` < Ui gY`ni fØW` "
9]bY`A i hhYf`VYf]W hYhž`XUgg`X]Y` ?]bXYf`bcW`i bhYf`GW cW`_ghY`Yb
i bX`XUg` ; YgW Y`YbY`_Ui a `VY[fY]ZYb`_ØbbYb`" ; Ya Å» `XYf
6]`Xi b[gVY`ØfXY`k]fX`gck c` `]b`XYf`đ [YbX`YfVYf[Y`U`g`Ui W`Ui Z
XYf`F ØW`ZU`fh'dgmW`c`c []gW Y`i bhYfghØhni b[`Ub[YVchYbž'i a `XYb
GW Ø'Yfb`ni `Y`ZYbž`XUg`9f`YVhY`ni `j YfUfVY]hYb"

9fa]hh`i b[Yb`XYf`Dc`]nY`]i bX`XYf`Ni ghUbX XYg` : U\ fYfg

8]Y`Dc`]nY` \Uh]bnk]gW Yb`Y]bY`F Y] \Y`j cb`9fa]hh`i b[Yb
Ub[Yghc» Ybž'i a `XYb` : U\ fYf`i bX`gY]b` : U\ fnYi [`Ui gZ]bX][`ni
a UW Yb'"8 Yf` : U\ fYf`XYg`a i ha U» `]W Yb`6A K !7UVf]cgž`XYf
nk]gW Yb`&\$`i bX` (\$`đU`fYb`U`h`gY]b`gc`hY`i bX`ni a `NY]hdi b`h`XYg
J cfZU`g`Y]bY`GW]`Xa ØhnY`hfi [ž`]gh`XYfnY]h`Ui ZXYf` : `i W`h`8]Y
Dc`]n]ghYb`j Yfa i hYb`Ui W`ž`XUgg`XYf`K U[Yb`Y]bY`VYgW ÅX][hY
: fcbhgW Y]VY`Ui Zk Y]gh"

8]Y`9fa]hh`i b[Yb` `Ui ZYb`Ui Z` < cW hci fYbž`XU`VYfY]hg`nU`fY]W Y
<]bk Y]gY`j cb`NYi [Yb`Y]b[Y[Ub[Yb`g]bX`"9g`k]fX`U`_hj `bUW`XYa
: U\ fnYi [` [Ygi W`hž'i bX`X]Y`9fa]hhYf` \UVYb`g]W`Ui W`Ub`? : NI
K Yf`_ghÅhhYb` [Yk UbXhž'i a `a Ø[`]W Yf` : `i W`ha Ø[`]W`_Y]hYb
bUW`ni [Y`Yb'"8 Yf`GdfYW Yf`XYf`Dc`]nY]ž`đ `]UbY`6ci hU` \Už
Åi » YfhY`XUg`Xf]b[YbXY`6YXØfZb]gž`? `Uf`Y]h`ØVYf`XYb`J cfZU` `ni
Yf`Ub[Ybž'i bX` \Uh`ni `ØZYb`h]W Yb` <]bk Y]gYb`Ui Z[Yfi ZYb"

8]Y`Dc`]nY`]d`Ubhž`X]Y`GW Ø'Yf']b`5bk YgYb`Y]hj cb

9fn]Y\i b[gVYfYW h][hYb`YfbYi hini`VYZfU[Ybž'i a`k Y]hYfY
`bZcfa Uh]cbYb`ØVYf`XYb`J cfZU``ni`gUa a`Y`b" `X`XYb`<]bk Y]g
_ØbbhY`X]Y`6YUa hYb`b`Ä`Yf`Ub`XYb`[YZØW hYhYb` : U`fYf`Vf]b[Ybž
k Ug`ZØf`X]Y`GW i`[Ya`Y]bgW UZh]j cb`[fc»Yf`6YXYi hi b[`]gh"

8]Y`[Ubny`G]hi Uh]cb`ghY`h`b]W h`bi`f`ZØf`X]Y`GW Ø`Yfž`gcbXYfb`Ui`W
ZØf`X]Y`Dc`]nY]i bX`X]Y`VYhY]][hYb`9`hYfb`Y]bY`[Yk`U`h][Y
6Y`Ughi b[`XUf" `8]Y`5i`Z`Äfi b[gUfVY]hi bX`X]Y`I a`gh`bXY`XYg
J cfZU``g`k YfZYb`j`]Y`Y` : fU[Yb`Ui`Zi`bX`a`UW`Yb`X]Y`HfU[k`Y]hY`XYg
 ; YgW`Y`Ybg`a`Y`f`U`g`XYi`h`]W"

9]b`5i`Zfi`Z`ni`f`NYi`[`Yb`\`]`ZY

8]Y`Dc`]nY]i`UddY``]Yfh`Ub`X]Y`2`ZZYbh]W`_Y]hž`a`Ø[`]W`Y`G]W`hi`b[`Yb
XYg`g]`VYfbYb`6A`K`!7UVf]cg`cXYf`<]bk`Y]gY`ni`XYa` : U`fYf`ni
a`Y`XYb" `9g`]gh`k`]W`h][`ž`XUgg`gc`W`Y`J`cfZÄ``Y`b]W`hi`b[`YghfUZh
V`Y]VYbž`i`bX`X]Y`6YUa`hYb`g]bX`Yb`hgW`c`ggYbž`XYb`J`cfZU``
i`a`ZUggYbX`Ui`Zni`_`ÄfYb" `X`a`Y`f`5i`[`Yb`g]W`Ui`Z`X]Y`GhfU»`Yb
_cbnYbhf]YfYbž`XYghc`[`fØ»`Yf`]gh`X]Y`7`\`UbW`ž`XUgg`XYf` : U`fYf`ni`f
F`YW`YbgW`UZh`[`Ync`[`Yb`k`]fX"

?`cb`hYI`hi`U`]g]Yfi`b[`X`Yf`?`UggYb`ZU`\`fh

8]Y`?`UggYb`ZU`\`fh`b`UW`f`Ø[`Ybž`Y]b`VY`]YVhYg`N]Y`ZØf`GW`i`_`UggYb
Ui`g`[`Ubn`8Yi`hgW`UbXž`]gh`c`Zh`Y]bY`A`Ø[`]W`_Y]h`ZØf`GW`Ø`Yfž
Ui`»`Yf`\`U`V`XYg`?`UggYbn]a`a`Yfg`ni`YfbYb`i`bX`gcn]U`Y
?`ca`dYhYbnYb`ni`Ybhk`]W`_Y`b" `9g`]gh`VY`_Ubbhž`XUgg`gc`W`Y`F`Y]gYb
gck`c`\`Y`\ffY]W`Y`U`g`Ui`W`Yf]bbYfi`b[`gk`ØfX][`Y`9f`YVb]ggY
gW`UZZYb`_ØbbYbž`YXcW`Ui`W`F`g]_Yb`a`]h`g]W`Vf]b[`Yb" `b
X]YgYa`gdYn]Y`Yb` : U``ZØ`fhY`XUg`Ni`gUa`a`YbhfYZZYb`Y]bYf
GW`Ø`Yf[`fi`ddY`a`]h`Y]bYa`5i`hc`ZU`\fYf`ni`Y]bYa`VYXUi`Yf`]W`Yb
i`bX`VYXfc`\`W`Yb`J`cfZU``ž`XYf`X]Y`G]W`Yf`\Y]hgZfU[`Y`ZØf`gc`W`Y
5i`gZØ[`Y`]b`XYb` : c`_i`g`fØW`h"

F`Ø[`Yb`]gh`8Yi`hgW`UbXg`[`fØ»`hY`b`gY`i`bX`n]Y`\`h`Ä`f`]W`HUi`gYbXY
j`cb`Hci`f]ghYb`Ubž`k`Ug`XUg`J`Yf`_Y`\fgUi`Z`ca`a`Yb`]b`VYgh]a`a`hYb
 ; YV]YhYbž`]bgVYgcbXYfY`]b`XYb`Gca`a`Yfa`cbUhYbž`Yf`\`Ø`h" `8]Y
GW`i`_`UggYb`g]bX`c`Zh]b`A`Y`\fVYhmn]a`a`Yfb`i`bhYf[`YVfUW`hž`k`Ug

ni gÄm`]WXY`c[]gh]gWXY`<YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb`i bX
J YfUbhk cfh`]WXY`hYb`ZØf`X]Y`VY[`Y]hYbXYb`@Y\fyf`VYXYi hYh"
Gc`WXY`5i gZØ[Y`i bhYf`Y[Yb`\Äi Z][`ghfYb[Yb
G]WXYf\Y]hgj cfgWk f]ZhYb`ž`i a `g]WXYfni ghY`Yb`ž`XUgg`U`Y`HY`bY\`a Yf
k Ä\fybX`XYf`FY]gY`VYhfYi h`i bX`[YgWk Øhnh`g]bX"

Dc`]nY`]WXY`9fa]hh`i b[Yb`i bX`fYWk h`]WXY 5gdY`_hY

8]Y`Dc`]nY`]U`h`i b`X]Y`5i Z[UVYž`XYb`J cfZU`i a ZUggYbX`ni
i bhYf`gi WXYb`"9fa]hh`i b[Yb`k Y[Yb` : U\fyfZi Wk`h`i bX`gWk YfYf
?ØfdYfj Yf`Yhni b[`g]bX`Yfb`ghni bY\`a YbXY`8Y`]_hY`"6Y]
: U\fyfZi Wk`h`j Yf`gi Wk`h`XYf`HÄ`hYfž`g]WXY`]bYf`J YfUbhk cfh`i b[`ni
Yb`h]Y\`Yb`ž`k Ug`c`Zh`gWk YfY`fYWk h`]WXY`?cbgYe`i YbnYb`bUW`g]Wk
n]Y\`h`"8]Y`9fa]hh`i b[Yb`_cbnYb`hf]YfYb`g]Wk`b]Wk`h`bi f`Ui Z`XYb
: U\fyfž`gcbXYfb`Ui Wk`Ui Z`X]Y`I a ghÄbXY`XYg`I bZU`g`i bX`X]Y
FYU`_h]cb`XYf` : fi ddY`j cb`GWk Ø`Yfb`ž`X]Y`i a [Y\`YbX`<`]ZY
`Y]ghYhYb`ž`]bXYa`g]Y`XYb`j Yf`YhnhYb`ž` b[Yb`]b`X]Y`ž` [YbX\`YfVYf[Y
hfi [Yb`"

8]Y`GWk YfY`XYf`J cfk ØfZY`_Ubb`ni `Ya`dZ]bX`]WXYb`GhfUZYb`ZØ\`fYbž
k Ybb`XYf`HÄ`hYf`[YZUggh`k]fX`"FYWk hgUb`k Ä`hY`Ui g`XYa`6YfY]Wk
J Yf`_Y\`fgfYWk`h`VYhc`bYb`ž`XUgg`X]Y`fYWk h`]WXYb` : c`[Yb`ZØf`XYb
: U\fyf`[fUj]YfYbX`g]bXž`]bgVYgcbXYfY`k Ybb`gWk YfY
J Yf`Yhni b[Yb`ni f` : c`[Y`XYg` , VYf[f]Zg`ZYgh[YghY`h`k YfXYb`"
Gc`WXY` : Ä`Y`_ØbbYb`Ui Wk`5i gk]f`_i b[Yb`Ui Z`X]Y`J Yfg]WXYfi b[
XYg` : U\fyfg`\UVYbž`X]Y`a`Ø[`]WXYfk Y]gY`Y]bY`?`U[Y`gY]hYbg`XYf
CdZYf`cXYf`XYfYb` : Ua`]]Yb`Yfk UfhYb`a`i`gg"

DgmWk]gWXY`I bhYfghØhni b[`ZØf`X]Y VYhfc ZZYbYb`GWk Ø`Yf

B UWk`gc`WXYb`hfUi a`Uh]gWXYb`9f`YVb]ggYb`]gh`X]Y`dgmWk]gWXY
: Ygi bX\`Y]h`XYf`VYhfc ZZYbYb`GWk Ø`Yf`j`cb`\`ØWk ghYf`K`]Wk h][`_Y]h`"
8]Y`6]`Xi b[gVY\`ØfXY`]b`6fYa`Yb`\`Uh`VYfY]hg`dgmWk`c`c[]gWXY
I bhYfghØhni b[`ZØf`X]Y`GWk Ø`Yf`]b`5i`gg]Wk`h[YghY`h`ž`k`Ug`]b`gc`WXYb
: Ä`Yb`U`g`GhUbXUfXdfUI]g[]`h`"8Yf`I a [Ub[`a`]h`HfUi a`U`b`UWk

Y]bYa 'I bZU''_Ubb''Ub[k]Yf)['i bX'\YfUi gZcfXYfbX'gY]bž'YVYbgc
k]Y'X]Y'J YfUfVY]hi b['XYf'; YgWXY\b]ggY'k Å\fybX'XYf
?'UggYbZU\fh"

9g' []Vh'nU\`fY]WXY'C f[Ub]gUh]cbYbž'X]Y'g]WXY'Ui Z'X]Y
dgmWXY'c`c []gWXY'I bhYfghØhni b['j cb'?'bXYfb'i bX'ž [YbX']WXYb'j]b
?f]gYbg]hi Uh]cbYb'gdYn]U`]g]YfYb" Gc`WXY': UWX_fÅZhY'gd]Y`Yb`Y]bY
YbhgWXY]XYbXY'Fc`Y'XUVY]ž'XYb'GWØ'Yfb'ni '\Y`ZYbž'\fY'; YZØ\`Y
ni 'j YfUfVY]hYb'i bX'GhfUHY []Yb' [Y[Yb'Ÿb[ghY'i bX'GhfYgg'ni
Ybhk]W_Y`b" DfcZYgg]cbY`Y'<]ZY'_Ubb`\Y`ZYbž`Ub[Zf]gh][Y
dgmWXY]gWXY'DfcV`Ya Y'ni 'j Yfa Y]XYb'i bX'X]Y'FYg]`Ybn'XYf
6YhfcZYbYb'ni 'ZØfXYfb"

8YhU]`g

6Ygi WXYb'G]Y'i bg'Ui Z.'X]Y!bUWXYf]WXYhYb"bYh